

Editorial Introduction

Inter-Religious and Inter-Convictional Dialogue: Overview of a Dialogical Process and Its Products

Introduction

Welcome to this special edition of *The Journal of Dialogue Studies* on the theme of ‘Inter-Religious and Inter-Convictional Dialogue’. This special edition is a joint initiative of the Dialogue Society¹ (which sponsors the journal) and the Oxford Centre for Religion and Culture (OCRC),² based at Regent’s Park College,³ University of Oxford.⁴ It is produced out of a collaboration between the Society and the Centre in relation to a series of seminars⁵ on ‘Inter-Religious and Inter-Convictional Dialogue’, an associated colloquium, and a book launch held at Regent’s Park College during the University’s Trinity Term 2022, between 9 May and 13 June inclusive.

Papers from Two Monographs and a Book Launch

The series began on 16 May with the launch of two books written by this author, as the main products of a research project that was financially supported by the Dialogue Society and conducted while the author was employed as a part-time Research Fellow in Religion and Society at Regent’s Park College, from 2018–21. In the seminar, the author gave an outline presentation of the contents of the two books, which was then responded to by two respondents for each book, to which the author, in turn, responded, followed by wider discussion with all those present at the launch event. In this way, the opening event aimed in itself to exemplify the kind of dialogical approach that was at the heart of the whole series and the four review articles

1 The Dialogue Society, see <https://www.dialoguesociety.org/>

2 See <https://www.rpc.ox.ac.uk/research-life/oxford-centre-christianity-culture/>

3 See <https://www.rpc.ox.ac.uk/>

4 See <https://www.ox.ac.uk/>

5 See <https://www.rpc.ox.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/Trinity-Term-2022-OCRC-Dialogue-Society-series.pdf>

on the books included as papers in this volume are therefore themselves dialogical products of this interactive process.⁶

The authors of review articles on the first book – *Fethullah Gülen’s Teaching and Practice: Inheritance, Context and Interactive Development*⁷ – are Dr. Martin Whittingham, Supernumerary Research Fellow, Regent’s Park College and Director, Centre for Muslim-Christian Studies Oxford, whose review article appears on pp.165-172; and Revd. Professor Paul Fiddes, Professor of Systematic Theology, University of Oxford and Director of the Study of Love in Religion Project, Regent’s Park College, University of Oxford, whose review article appears on pp. 173-188.

The author of the review article on the second book – on *Hizmet in Transitions: European Developments of a Turkish Muslim-Inspired Movement*⁸ – is Emeritus Professor Jørgen Nielsen, Emeritus Professor of Contemporary European Islam and Affiliate Professor, University of Copenhagen, whose review article appears on pp. 183-188.

These review articles, together with the summary outlines of the contents of these books (as found below in pp. 11-20 of this introduction) are included in this special edition on ‘Inter-Religious and Inter-Convictional Dialogue’ because Fethullah Gülen has been an important Muslim advocate for, and exponent of, dialogue while in its various manifestations found throughout the world, and while various diverse manifestations of the Hizmet movement have always had dialogue as one of the principal foci of their activities. Therefore, both the teaching and practice of Fethullah Gülen and the practice of dialogue by Hizmet are potential resources for those wishing to engage in, and critically reflect upon the inter-religious and inter-convictional dialogue which is the focus of this special edition.

Papers From Four Dialogical Seminars and a Round Table Colloquium

The book launches were followed by a series of seminars, also held at Regent’s Park College, between 16 May and 6 June, at which presenters had up to 45 minutes to make their presentations, followed by at least 30 minutes of questions and wider discussion with seminar participants. The presenters of these papers were invited to

6 The content of the main presentations and initial responses (but not the wider discussions) from the book launch event can be accessed via the OCRC’s YouTube Channel at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZnS0rpMlf28>.

7 For PDF/ePub texts, see <https://link.springer.com/book/10.1007/978-3-030-97363-6>

8 For PDF/ePub texts, see <https://link.springer.com/book/10.1007/978-3-030-93798-0>

make their presentations from a position of identification with the religion or belief tradition concerned and therefore to offer an ‘internal’ (but not uncritical) perspective.⁹ They were also asked to address the lived and broadly contemporary realities of the members of the religion or belief traditions concerned and not only what is articulated in their scriptures, doctrines, or other foundational documents separately from how these are lived. Apart from these guidelines, the presenters were given the choice more narrowly to focus and illustrate the broad traditions and themes of each proposed paper on specific aspects, issues, themes geographies, movements, organisations or key individuals in the traditions concerned. The foci chosen by each author are reflected in the sub-titles of their articles as these appear in this special edition of the journal.

In between the seminars, the presenters were supplied with written versions of each other’s original presentations as developed further by the presenters in the light of the discussions of the presentations at each of the seminars. In summation of this process, on 13 June, a round table colloquium was held at which the original presenters each made ten-minute ‘bullet point’ responses to the papers of each of the others. The authors of the papers were then given twenty minutes to respond to these inputs followed, in each case, by a half hour of discussion open to all who were in attendance at the colloquium.¹⁰ As with the reviews of the two books launched at the start of the seminar series, out of this process each of the presenters finalised four of the substantive papers on ‘Inter-Religious and Inter-Convictional Dialogue’ that are included in this special edition.

These are the papers on ‘Muslims and Dialogue’ (pp. 25-41) by Dr Sariya Cheruvalil-Contractor, Associate Professor, Research Institute for Peace, Security and Social Justice, Coventry University; on ‘Humanists and Dialogue’ (pp. 59-79) by Jeremy Rodell, Dialogue Officer, Humanists UK; on ‘Christians and Dialogue’ (pp. 11-24) by Emeritus Professor Michael Taylor, Emeritus Professor of Social Theology, University of Birmingham; and ‘Jews and Dialogue’ (pp. 42-58) by Rabbi Jackie Tabick,

9 The content of the main presentations and initial responses (but not the wider discussions) of the four seminars on ‘Muslims and Dialogue’, ‘Humanists and Dialogue’, ‘Christians and Dialogue’, and ‘Jews and Dialogue’, respectively, can be found via the OCRC’s You Tube Channel at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_f_Rb3th4Qc; https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pIFqIwP_hDQ; <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TOj6-dtaKwA>; and <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OkiulbkGIO8>.

10 The content of the bullet-point responses and further main presenter responses to these (but not the wider discussions) can be accessed via the OCRC’s You Tube Channel at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TUKEWfM3DhQ>.

Convenor of the Beit Din for British Reform Judaism and European Movement for Progressive Judaism.

Other Papers

The range of traditions that were included in the seminar series partly reflected the organisational and pragmatic constraint that the regular termly seminar series of the Oxford Centre for Religion and Culture, and onto which this jointly sponsored series was mapped, normally consists of no more than eight sessions on Mondays in each University of Oxford eight-week term, with the series in the summer, Trinity Term, usually being of fewer weeks due to the presence of two bank holidays in that term, meaning that the overall series concept could only accommodate four traditions.

The four traditions that were chosen for the original seminar series reflected those with which Fethullah Gülen's teaching, and practice of dialogue has, arguably, most directly interacted, although both his own teaching and practice, and certainly the dialogical practice of the Hizmet movement extend beyond those traditions alone. Therefore, the organisers of the series and editors of this special edition were mindful that, unless additional measures were taken, the traditions engaged in this special edition would have been limited to what are often called the 'Abrahamic' ones of Islam, Christianity, and Judaism, apart from the Humanist tradition which, at least in its western forms, arguably has a close historical interactive interrelationship with these particular traditions.

In order to be more inclusive than was possible within a limited number of in-person seminars that could be held in a single academic term, it was decided to issue an open call for papers to be submitted from authors (albeit without benefit of having participated in the seminar process described above) to contribute to this special edition on the additional themes of 'Buddhists and Dialogue'; 'Hindus and Dialogue'; 'Sikhs and Dialogue'; and 'Pagans and Dialogue'. The article on 'Buddhists and Dialogue' (pp. 124-142) is written by Dr. Phil Henry, pp. 124-142; that on 'Hindus and Dialogue' (pp. 80-102) is written by Ramesh Pattni, 80-102; that on 'Sikhs and Dialogue' (pp. 103-123) is written by Pashaura Singh, Distinguished Professor and Dr. J.S. Saini Endowed Chair in Sikh and Punjabi Studies at the University of California, Riverside; while that on 'Pagans and Dialogue' (pp. 143-164) is written by Dr. Prudence Jones, 143-164.

All the articles in this section of the journal, whether those which were the direct product of the dialogical process of seminars and a colloquium, or those that were otherwise directly submitted by their authors without involvement in such a dialogical process, were subject to input from the journal's normal processes of peer re-

view. At the same time, in comparison with the normal general editions of the journal, in the instance of this particular edition, editorial decision making around copy-editing and final inclusion was also informed by a recognition of the oral and discursively dialogical nature of the original seminar contributions, which is partially retained in the written articles based upon those; as well as the strongly practitioner rooting and flavour of those papers in particular.

As a result of these differences in origin and development, we are aware that there is some degree of unevenness in terms of overall style and flavour between the first four and second four papers on dialogue and the specific traditions concerned. But because we continued to think it important for this special edition to be inclusive of what are often called the ‘Dharmic’ traditions, as well as of the contemporary exponents of the pre-Christian traditions of Europe, despite these differences, we have included both sets of papers.

Fethullah Gülen and Hizmet in Europe: Research Project and Monographs

As noted above, the research that lies behind the two monographs, the launch event for which started the series on ‘Inter-Religious and Inter-Convictional Dialogue’, was conducted from a base at Regent’s Park College, University of Oxford, where it was financially supported by charitable donations made through the Dialogue Society. Taking account of the University’s Conflict of Interest policy, the research ethics of the project were approved by University of Oxford Humanities and Social Sciences Divisional Research Ethics Committee. Primary research was conducted from 2017–2020.

Together with a review of relevant literature, the books are informed by semi-structured interviews with 29 mostly attributable people, including Fethullah Gülen; some close associates of his; some individuals publicly associated with Hizmet organisations in Europe; and some (anonymous) Hizmet asylum-seekers. Methodologically speaking, the books took a Religious Studies evidence-based approach, rather than approaching the phenomena concerned via prior sociological or theological theories. At the same time research reflexivity and evaluative positionality was not excluded.

Although both books can be read independently, when read together in a complementary way, they add more detailed information and texture to some things that are not appropriate to discuss in equal detail across both books. Taken together, they even more strongly illuminate the dynamic inter-relationships between Fethullah Gülen’s teaching and practice; they show that teaching and practice has historically

developed and is still developing in a contextually informed way; and they show how those inspired by its inheritance have taken it forward within different contextual trajectories, which, within an overall hermeneutical circle has, in turn, informed Fethullah Gülen's islamically rooted but also continually contextually developing reflective teaching and practice. Their structure is as follows:

Fethullah Gülen's Teaching and Practice: Context and Interactive Development

This is the first book of its kind about the Turkish Muslim scholar, Fethullah Gülen,¹¹ since the July 2016 events in Turkey and what followed, which includes the trauma experienced by both Fethullah Gülen and the initiatives inspired by his teaching and practice, known as Hizmet.¹² It explores Gülen's teaching and practice interactively with changing geographical and temporal contexts. Distinctively, it argues that just as Hizmet cannot be understood apart from Gülen, so Gülen and his teaching cannot be understood apart from Hizmet, and the religious roots of both. Drawing on primary interviews with Gülen and Hizmet participants and a review of relevant literature, it argues that both Gülen's teaching and Hizmet have clear origins in the Qur'an and Sunnah as dynamically developed through their geographical, temporal and existential reception, translation, and onward communication. This includes how the life and teaching of Gülen has itself developed through engagement with questions and issues arising from Hizmet's practice, as well as what the future heritage of both might be. A more detailed and geographically focused case study of this process is set out in the complementary volume on *Hizmet in Transitions: European Developments of a Turkish Muslim-Inspired Movement*, also published by Palgrave Macmillan.

Preface

Acknowledgements

1. Introduction

- 1.1 The Focus of the Book
- 1.2 A Religious Studies Approach
- 1.3 Situating in the Wider Literature
- 1.4 Evidence, Aims, and Methods

11 See <https://fgulen.com/en/fethullah-gulens-life-en/introducing-fethullah-gulen-en>

12 See <https://afsv.org/about-us/hizmet-movement/>

This chapter provides insight into the focus of the book, which is on the person, teaching, and practice of Fethullah Gülen, rather than on Hizmet – which his teaching and practice has inspired – and which is addressed more fully in the complementary volume on *Hizmet in Transitions: European Developments of a Turkish Muslim-Inspired Movement*. The chapter discusses the book’s disciplinary and methodological approach, which is located within Religious Studies and takes seriously Fethullah Gülen’s deep rooting in the Qur’an and Sunnah. Given the controversies that exist around the person and work of Fethullah Gülen, it situates this book within the context of the wider literature, including both a scholarly and more popular kind, that discusses his person and work, including other publications by the author. Finally, it explains the book’s approach to its use of evidence and discusses the issue of positionality in relation to work of this kind.

Part I Turkish Muslim Scholar, Preacher, and Activist

2 Person, Places, and Development

- 2.1 Biographies of Fethullah Gülen
- 2.2 Erzurum: Traditional Contextualisation
- 2.3 Edirne: Secular and Plural Contextualisation
- 2.4 Izmir: Creative Contextualisation Through Differentiation
- 2.5 Istanbul: Withdrawal and Cosmopolitan Engagement
- 2.6 Pivotal Role of Educational Initiatives
- 2.7 Europe, Turkish Eurasia, and Beyond
- 2.8 ‘Enemy of the State’

In this chapter, Fethullah Gülen’s early historical and contextual environments are set out as providing a necessary context for understanding the book’s overall argument. While not a biography of Fethullah Gülen, the book emphasises the importance of interactivity between his context, his person and his teaching for understanding the changes and developments in his teaching and practice. This chapter focuses particularly on four Turkish contexts – Erzurum, Edirne, Izmir, and Istanbul – each of which corresponds with a particular phase in Gülen’s and Hizmet’s development: from traditional formation in Erzurum; through secular and plural encounter in Edirne; to new creativity and differentiation from other Islamic movements in Izmir; and via withdrawal while being treated as an ‘enemy of the state,’ followed by cosmopolitan engagement in Istanbul.

Part II Islamic Rootedness, Taboo-Breaking, and Socio-religious Implications

3. Biography, Context, and Substance in Interplay

- 3.1 Turmoil as Turkish Context
- 3.2 Distinctive Scholar, Teacher, and Innovator
- 3.3 Sources, Places, Times, and Revelatory Dynamics
- 3.4 Overcoming Secular-Political Taboos
- 3.5 Overcoming National-Cultural Taboos
- 3.6 Overcoming Religious Boundary Taboos

This chapter begins by identifying the specificity of the Turkish context in terms of balances of historical and contemporary forces in relation to which Fethullah Gülen and Hizmet have had to position themselves. It shows how out of this, Gülen emerged as a distinctive scholar, teacher, and innovator, becoming differentiated from the inheritance of Said Nursi, while also drawing upon it. It discusses Gülen's understanding of interplay between Islamic sources; his conscious engagement of those sources with historical and contemporary places and times; and his understanding of revelation in dynamic terms. Out of this interplay, the chapter provides a range of examples of Gülen's role as taboo-breaker in teaching and action regarding the secular-political taboos; national-cultural identity taboos; and religious boundary taboos that have otherwise had a strong and constraining hold on Turkish society.

4 Islamic Spirituality and Social Processing

- 4.1 Muslim Insecurity, the 'Heroic' Tradition, and Alternative Hermeneutics
- 4.2 Spirituality, the True Human, Love, and Service
- 4.3 For Human Freedom
- 4.4 Against Theocracy and for Democracy
- 4.5 Islam, Terror, and Deradicalisation by Default

This chapter starts by discussing the evident historical and sociological insecurity of many contemporary Muslims. It identifies a sense of theological insecurity, some of the roots of which can be located in a kind of 'heroic' tradition of Islam that has shaped and been shaped by a combative and reactive hermeneutic. By contrast with such stories, Fethullah Gülen's hermeneutics are centrally rooted in the narratives of Muhammad and his first Companions. The chapter furthermore explains how the spirituality that is promoted by Fethullah Gülen centres around the Sufi emphases

on love and the idea of the ‘true human.’ These are then explored in engagement with Gülen’s expansive approach to human (including religious) freedom; his stance against claimed theocracies and in support of democracy; and finally, the challenge that his hermeneutics brings to the conflation of Islam and terror in the mind of the general public as well the legitimacy of an association between the two in the world-view of some Muslims.

Part III Islamic Heroism, Hizmet Loss, and a Future Beyond Gülen?

5. Learning from Loss?

5.1 Wounded Exile

5.2 Gülen, Hizmet, and Dealing with Trauma

5.3 The Hijrah Interpretation and Post-Fact Religious Causality

5.4 Self-Criticism and Its Limits

This chapter underlines the profoundly traumatic impact of the events of July 2016 in Turkey and their aftermath for both Fethullah Gülen and for Hizmet. It gives insight into Gülen’s current situation as being one that is described as that of a ‘wounded exile,’ who nevertheless has retained an eternal perspective in relation to the current Turkish powers-that-be. It explores the ways in which both Fethullah Gülen and Hizmet are trying to deal with this trauma, including the interpretations of it with which people are working, including a reinterpretation of the important Islamic trope of hijrah. This reinterpretation is brought together with a critical discussion of the phenomenon of understanding difficult historical events through the lens of post-fact religious causality. Finally, the chapter discusses the degree of self-criticism that can now be found within Hizmet, together with its limits and the resistance found to such self-criticism in some parts of Hizmet.

6. Inheritance, Methodology, Integrity, and Creativity

6.1 Evaluating Gülen Interactively with Hizmet

6.2 Distinctive Normativity and Ordinary ‘Normality’

6.3 Gülen and Hizmet: Now and Beyond

6.4 Linguistic Deposits, Interpretive Processing, and Informed Application

6.5 The Methodology of Learning by Doing

6.6 Love, the Human, and Ecumenical Ijtihads in Action

6.7 Going Beyond Gülen?

This final chapter attempts a preliminary evaluation of Gülen's inheritance in interaction with the potential futures of Hizmet. An important creative tension is identified between what the chapter calls the 'distinctive normativity' of Gülen's approach and an increasing awareness of its relative 'normality' found among many Hizmet participants. In the light of Fethullah Gülen's mortality, the challenges arising for the interpretation and appropriation of his heritage are discussed. At the heart of this is identified not so much a body of teaching to be preserved and passed on, but rather a methodological approach rooted in the Qur'an and Sunnah coupled with a readiness to learn by doing, including through the risks entailed in attempting new expressions of faithful action. In closing, the chapter identifies how such an approach might offer a resource for an appropriately confident Muslim engagement in the doing of current Ijtihads, on an ecumenically inclusive basis.

Hizmet in Transitions: European Developments of a Turkish-Muslim Inspired Movement

This is the first book about the Turkish Muslim origin movement known as Hizmet (or 'service') in Europe since the July 2016 events in Turkey and what followed. It addresses the trauma experienced by Hizmet participants in Turkey, Hizmet asylum-seekers, and Hizmet people and organisations of longstanding in Europe. Drawing on primary interviews with Hizmet participants and a review of relevant literature, it discusses the transitions of Hizmet especially in Belgium, Denmark, France, Germany, Italy, Netherlands, Spain, Switzerland, and the UK. In the context of Hizmet's 'de-centring' from Turkey, it explores Hizmet's challenge to terror in the name of Islam while itself facing some accusations of terrorism. It unpacks previous internal debates, now intensified, around: Hizmet's relationship to Turkishness; its handling of gender; debates about charisma, structures, and transparency within civil society, politics, and the state; and Hizmet's relationships with other Muslims. Finally, it evaluates how far Hizmet in Europe can heal from its wounds to reinvent itself. The complementary volume on *Fethullah Gülen's Teaching and Practice: Inheritance, Context and Interactive Development*, also published by Palgrave Macmillan, argues that such expressions of Hizmet are as necessary for properly understanding developments in Fethullah Gülen's teaching and practice, as he and his teaching are for understanding them.

Preface

Acknowledgements

1. Introduction

1.1 The Focus of the Book

1.2 A Religious Studies Approach and the ‘Politics of Naming’

1.3 Situating in the Author’s Previous Research and the Wider Literature

1.4 Evidence, Aims and Methods

This introduction highlights the book’s focus on transitions in Hizmet in Europe following the events of July 2016 in Turkey, rather than on the person and teaching of Fethullah Gülen. That is the focus of the complementary volume on *Fethullah Gülen’s Teaching and Practice: Inheritance, Context and Interactive Development*. The chapter discusses the book’s disciplinary and methodological approach that is situated within Religious Studies, and therefore takes seriously Hizmet’s understanding of itself in relation to religion. Nevertheless, given the controversies that exist around this phenomenon, the politics of naming is acknowledged and critically discussed. This discussion is situated within the widely diverse literature, disciplinary perspectives, and positionalities relating to Hizmet, including those of the author himself. Finally, the importance and distinctiveness of this book’s primary interview material with Fethullah Gülen and Hizmet participants are underlined.

Part I Hizmet in Turkish Origins and European Development

2 Turkish Origins and Development

2.1 Hizmet: The Emergence of a Phenomenon

2.2 Turkey’s Need for More Schools, Not More Mosques

2.3 Turkey’s Deep Fissures, Need for Dialogue and Hizmet Responses

2.4 Relief of Poverty

2.5 Business Links

2.6. The Media

2.7 Spread to ‘Turkic’ Republics of the Former USSR and to the Western Balkans

This chapter locates Hizmet’s origins and development in Turkey, emerging interactively with Fethullah Gülen as a Muslim scholar and teacher of a dynamic expression of Islam which inspired businesspeople and students to realise their faith through initiatives of Hizmet, or service. The chapter discusses how these initiatives developed from the opening of educational opportunities to pious Muslims whose horizons had been previously restricted; through the creation of dialogue initiatives that provided fora for people to engage across deep historical fissures between the religious and the secular; to engagement in work for the relief of poverty. From these three foci, which became characteristic of Hizmet initiatives throughout the world, Hizmet further grew into a network of business associations and media organisa-

tions, thereby achieving considerable reach and influence in Turkey. Following the end of the USSR, the chapter traces how Hizmet's educational initiatives spread into formerly Soviet Turkic countries and the Western Balkans.

3. Hizmet in European Hijrah

3.1 Hizmet at European Level and Across Europe

3.2 Hizmet in the Netherlands

3.3 Hizmet in Germany

3.4 Hizmet in Belgium

3.5 Hizmet in the United Kingdom (UK)

3.6 Hizmet in Switzerland

3.7 Hizmet in France

3.8 Hizmet in Spain

3.9 Hizmet in Italy

3.10 Hizmet in Denmark

3.11 Hizmet in Some Other European Countries

This chapter forms the descriptive core and foundation for how the book subsequently moves into a more critical and evaluative discussion of a range of key issues within Hizmet's transitions in Europe from its first appearance until the traumatic impact of the events of July 2016 in Turkey. Together with a European overview, the chapter especially traces Hizmet's development within each of the countries of Belgium, Denmark, France, Germany, Italy, Netherlands, Spain, Switzerland, and the UK, before briefly touching on its presence and activity in a number of other Scandinavian, Eastern and Central European countries. In doing so, it especially draws upon primary research material derived from interviews with a range of key individuals in Hizmet who have been publicly associated with it in the countries concerned, while also setting these sources within the descriptive and analytical contributions of other relevant literature.

Part II Hizmet in Turkish De-centring and European Transitions

4. Pivotal Issues in Pivotal Times

4.1. The AKP and Hizmet: Walking in Tandem?

4.2 Mutual 'Infiltration'?

4.3 The MV Mavi Marmara Incident: A Sign of Things to Come

4.4 From Gezi Park to 15 July 2016

4.5. Hizmet Trauma in Turkey and Europe

4.6. Three-Layered Hizmet: Challenges and Opportunities

This chapter traces how what some see as a previously close relationship between Turkey's ruling AKP party and Hizmet deteriorated from conflict over corruption charges in relation to the government; through the Gezi Park protests; and down to the events of July 2016 and their aftermath. It takes the MV Mavi Marmara incident as illustrative of the distinctive and differentiated approach to such issues taken by Fethullah Gülen compared with that of Turkish Islamists and nationalists. The profound trauma of 15 July 2016 and its aftermath is laid bare through personal interview testimonies of Hizmet asylum-seekers and others directly impacted by this, while its indirect effects upon Hizmet individuals and initiatives previously established in Europe are also discussed. Finally, the chapter identifies the emergence in Europe of what he calls a 'three-layered Hizmet' consisting of early migrants, a generation of more recently emerging leaders and the new arrivals post-July 2016.

5. New Foci for Old Questions

5.1 Changing Contexts

5.2 Seen as Terrorists and Challenging Terrorism

5.3. Turkishness and Beyond

5.4 Charisma, Structures and Transparency

5.5 Relating to Civil Society, Politics and the State

5.6 Relating to Other Muslims

5.7 Gender in Transition

The extent and depth of trauma experienced by Hizmet consequent upon the events of July 2016 and their aftermath should not be underestimated. Their impact has brought a new 'layer' of Hizmet people to Europe who often bring with them cultural assumptions different to Hizmet people who grew up in Europe. Hizmet in Europe's financial resource base and models have been challenged. However, in many other matters, the impact of July 2016 has, rather, intensified and accelerated debate around what were previously recognised issues but which were being engaged with in a more evolutionary way. These included debates about the extent of Hizmet's Turkishness or otherwise; gender in transition; the relationship between charisma, structures and transparency in connection with civil society, politics and the state; relationships with other Muslims and Hizmet's efforts to challenge terror in the name of Islam while in some quarters also being seen as terrorists.

6. Continuing Values, Different Expressions and Future Trajectories

6.1 Contextual Transitions

6.2 Education to Tackle Ignorance

6.3 Dialogue to Tackle Conflict and Promote Inclusive Integration

6.4 Helping to Relieve Poverty Developing into Supporting Human Rights

6.5 Meeting Needs and Keeping the Balance

6.6 Hizmet in Europe With and/or Without Fethullah Gülen

6.7 Confident Engagement, Islamic Self-Criticism and Human Focus

6.8 From Copy-Paste into Contextual Reinvention

This concluding chapter traces the emerging recognition within Hizmet in Europe that, while Hizmet's values to do with education, dialogue and the relief of poverty may continue into the future, they should not be replicated in a 'copy-paste' manner. Rather, in Hizmet's future trajectories, these values will need always to be contextually reconsidered and reinvented, taking account of national differences and changing human needs. Indeed, it is argued that, alongside its 'de-centring' from Turkey, Hizmet in Europe (and internationally) is becoming more of a networking of diverse experience than a common but differentiated programme. And this is all happening in a period during which Hizmet in Europe will increasingly need to prepare for a future without the person of Fethullah Gülen in which it will need itself to find ways of appropriately building upon his heritage of a properly confident Islamic engagement, informed by self-criticism, with a focus on the human.

Invitation to Reader Engagement with the Special Edition

This special edition of *The Journal of Dialogue Studies* is, on the one hand, intended as a resource for 'Inter-Religious and Inter-Convictional Dialogue.' On the other hand, it is also intended to be an invitation from myself,¹³ as Academic Editor of the Journal; from Sadik Cinar,¹⁴ as Executive Director of the Dialogue Society; and from Dr. Anthony Reddie,¹⁵ as Director of the Oxford Centre for Religion and Culture, to the readers of the journal, yourselves, to engage in such dialogue, beginning

¹³ See <https://www.rpc.ox.ac.uk/people/professor-paul-weller/>

¹⁴ See <https://uk.linkedin.com/in/sadik-cinar-05574629>

¹⁵ See <https://www.rpc.ox.ac.uk/people/prof-anthony-reddie/>

with a dialogical reading engagement with the papers that follow, which papers themselves commence with the review articles on the two monographs that have been outlined above.

Dr. Paul Weller,
Academic Editor, *Journal of Dialogue Studies*, February 2023

Also Non-Stipendiary Research Fellow in Religion and Society, Regent's Park College, University of Oxford, where he is an Associate Member of the Faculty of Theology and Religion and Associate Director of the Oxford Centre for Religion and Culture; Emeritus Professor of the University of Derby; Visiting Professor of the Centre for Trust, Peace and Social Relations, Coventry University.